



DORSET

POLICE & CRIME
COMMISSIONER

AGENDA NO: 5

POLICE AND CRIME PANEL - 1 FEBRUARY 2019

APPOINTMENT OF CHIEF CONSTABLE

PURPOSE OF THE REPORT

To provide notification of the Police and Crime Commissioner's preferred candidate for the role of Chief Constable for Dorset Police, and to seek confirmation of this proposed appointment, as required by the Police Reform and Social Responsibility Act 2011.

1. INTRODUCTION

1.1 Temporary Chief Constable James Vaughan QPM is the Police and Crime Commissioner's (PCC's) preferred candidate for the role of Chief Constable for Dorset Police.

1.2 The Police Reform and Social Responsibility Act 2011 (PRSRA 2011) sets out a range of information that must be supplied by the PCC to the Police and Crime Panel as part of the confirmation process, as follows (Schedule 8, 3):

- the name of the person whom the PCC is proposing to appoint ("the candidate") [given in section 1, Introduction];
- the criteria used to assess the suitability of the candidate for the appointment [given in section 4, Criteria];
- why the candidate satisfies those criteria [given in section 5, Assessment]; and
- the terms and conditions on which the candidate is to be appointed [given in Appendix A].

1.3 Following this, the Police and Crime Panel must review this information and make a report to the PCC on the proposed appointment. The Police and Crime Panel has the power to veto the appointment.

2. BACKGROUND

2.1 In the unique circumstances following the announcement by the Chief Constables of Dorset Police and of Devon & Cornwall Police to explore further collaborative working, including the option of a full merger, there was a possibility that Dorset Police might not exist as a legal entity post May 2020.

2.2 Therefore, following the planned retirement of Chief Constable Debbie Simpson QPM on 6 April 2018, the PCC deemed it appropriate to appoint a Temporary Chief Constable for Dorset Police, for an extended period, until the potential outcome of the alliance/merger development work became clear.

2.3 Following a decision on the merger being taken in October 2018, a full, open recruitment process was undertaken, in accordance with the requirements of the PRSRA 2011 and the College of Policing guidance for the appointment of chief officers to identify a substantial Chief Constable for Dorset Police.

2.4 As was expected, and as has been the case with the vast majority of Chief Constable appointments in recent years, the campaign resulted in a similarly low number of applications; in this case one.

3. PROCESS

3.1 The vacancy was advertised locally (PCC website) and nationally (Association of PCCs website) as per best practice. Feedback received confirmed that the national chief officer cohort knew about the vacancy.

3.2 The shortlisting and interview panel was arranged. Given the Chief Constable is a significant role, this panel was specifically designed to include a range of participants whom represented areas which had an impact on the delivery of policing services, as follows (area of specialism in brackets):

- Helen Donnellan - Chair, Independent Audit Committee (finance);
- Sarah Elliott - Independent Chair, Bournemouth, Poole and Dorset Local Safeguarding Children Boards (safeguarding and vulnerability);
- Matt Prosser - Chief Executive Designate, Dorset Council (partnerships); and
- Martyn Underhill - Dorset PCC (crime and policing), and panel Chair.

In addition, the panel would be advised by Simon Bullock (Chief Executive, Dorset OPCC) and observed by Mike Short (Chair, Dorset Police and Crime Panel), both of whom attended and observed the shortlisting and interview.

3.3 Collectively, the panel has extensive experience of recruiting at a senior executive level. It was confirmed that no panel member, nor either of the observers, had any conflict that necessitated declaration.

3.4 Relevant national guidance requires at least one of the panel to be an independent member. A key role of the independent member is to ensure the appointment principles of merit, fairness and openness are followed and to verify the extent to which the panel were able to fulfil their purpose (for example to challenge and test that the candidate meets the necessary requirements to perform the role).

3.5 Matt Prosser agreed to act as the independent member of the panel, and has written a separate report to the Police and Crime Panel confirming the fairness of the process and decision making (Appendix E).

3.6 A comprehensive information pack for candidates was produced, and all the supporting information reviewed and revised. This included the terms and conditions of the appointment being confirmed by the Alliance Legal Services department, and the assessment criteria being reviewed by the College of Policing.

3.7 The shortlisting and interview panel received training on the Chief Constable appointment process, delivered by the College of Policing, ahead of the shortlisting process. The purpose of this training was for the panel to:

- gain a shared understanding of the assessment criteria;
- discuss and agree what effective and ineffective performance looks like; and

- understand the principles of fair and merit based assessments and how to apply this consistently.

Mel Hill, Higher Psychologist, who wrote the College of Policing document 'Guidance for the Appointment of Chief Officers', delivered this training.

4. CRITERIA

- 4.1 The selection criteria used to assess the suitability of candidates at both the shortlisting and interview stage is summarised below:

Competency / Behaviour
<p>Strategic perspective Looks at issues with a broad view to achieve the organisation's goals. Creates a vision for the future and a strategy for how it can be achieved. Understands external expectations and influences on the organisation or unit. Identifies common goals, interests and perspectives with other agencies.</p>
<p>Negotiation and influencing Develops sophisticated strategies for influencing others at all levels in the organisation. Negotiates satisfactory solutions on broad or complicated issues with stakeholders.</p>
<p>Maximising potential Puts systems and strategies in place that develop people at all levels of the organisation. Creates an environment where staff are motivated to achieve results.</p>
<p>Respect for diversity Understands other people's views and takes them into account. Is tactful and diplomatic when dealing with people, treating them with dignity and respect at all times. Understands and is sensitive to social, cultural and racial differences.</p>
<p>Community and customer focus Maintains a broad understanding of social trends and identifies what effect they will have on the organisation. Creates processes that make sure stakeholders' and customers' views and needs are clearly identified and responded to. Puts in place strategies for media and community relations.</p>
<p>Resilience Shows reliability and resilience in difficult circumstances. Remains calm and confident, and responds logically and decisively in difficult situations.</p>
<p>Managing the organisation Leads the development, implementation, monitoring and review of change programmes.</p>
<p>Managing and developing people Monitors and maintains standards of professional conduct within own organisation in consultation with the Police Authority, stakeholders and chief officer colleagues. Develops and implements effective systems to enhance standards and increase customer confidence.</p>
<p>Community Safety Manages partnership arrangements which address community and agency needs and contribute to the reduction of crime and disorder.</p>

Police Operations

Evaluates, authorises and reviews proposed operations ensuring that they are ethical, comply with legislation, policy and procedures and meet best practice.

Marketing and communication

Determines and implements a strategy for dealing with the media during major enquires and incidents.

Personal responsibility

Assumes overall command of a pre-planned or emerging incident, determining and communicating the strategy for the policing and effective joint agency management of the incident. Ensures that adequate resources are available and appropriate police action is taken to achieve the objectives set.

- 4.2 The selection criteria were provided to the panel beforehand, and during the training session each one was discussed in detail. The criteria themselves reflect the national Competency and Values Framework recommended by the College of Policing to ensure that candidates demonstrate the key competencies required at the Chief Constable level.
- 4.3 The application form was designed to pose a single question in relation to each of the 12 competencies, but allow candidates the opportunity to provide evidence of suitability, skills, experience, and relevant continuing professional development. Candidates were required to provide a reference for each response to ensure a robust and accurate process.
- 4.4 Candidates not currently working at the Chief Constable level, whether on a substantive or temporary basis, were additionally required to ask their existing Chief Constable to complete an assessment of their suitability for the rank.
- 4.5 The interview followed a traditional structured format, with panel members taking turns to pose predetermined questions designed to probe each one of the assessment criteria. During the training, panel members highlighted a number of areas for further examination, and these areas were worked into the interview questions, ensuring the full remit of each criterion was tested.
- 4.6 Throughout the interview process each panel member was free to challenge the candidate. Each member took extensive notes, and at the end of the process these were used to assist determining the performance and suitability of the candidate.
- 4.7 This detailed and rigorous process resulted in a unanimous decision to recommend that James Vaughan be appointed.

5. ASSESSMENT

- 5.1 In the first instance, the Chief Executive assessed the candidate's application to have met the minimum eligibility criteria for the role, as set out in the role profile (and included in the candidate application pack). These included: holding the rank of Assistant Chief Constable/Commander or a more senior rank in a UK Police Force; having successfully completed the Senior Police National Assessment Centre and the Strategic Command Course; having Authorising Officer Training; and having wide-ranging law enforcement experience.
- 5.2 The candidate was scored at both the shortlist and the interview stage against the following scale:

- A. The applicant has provided **convincing evidence** which you can support of an **outstanding** ability to perform this competency in the rank and role being applied for and across the range of activities set out in the job profile.
- B. The applicant has provided **convincing evidence** which you can support of an ability to perform this competency to a **high standard** in the rank and role being applied for and across the range of activities set out in the job profile.
- C. The applicant has provided **convincing evidence** which you can support of an ability to perform this competency to the **required standard** in the rank and role being applied for and across the range of activities set out in the job profile.
- D. The applicant has provided **some evidence** which you can support of an ability to perform some of this competency area to the **required standard** in the rank and role being applied for and across the range of activities set out in the job profile.
- E. The applicant has provided **some evidence** that relates to this competency area but it **does not show that they could perform this competency to the required standard** in the rank and role being applied for and across the range of activities set out in the job profile.

5.3 The panel agreed its minimum expectations beforehand. It was confirmed that the candidate's responses to each assessment criteria must achieve a moderated score of at least 'C' (i.e. meets required standard). However, given the high expectation of this role, the panel agreed it would be desirable for the candidate to score a minimum of 'B' against each assessment criteria.

5.4 The candidate, James Vaughan, scored highly at the shortlisting phase, and it was the consensus of the panel that he be invited for interview. A single point of feedback on his application was provided to Mr Vaughan post shortlisting.

5.5 At interview, Mr Vaughan demonstrated the breadth of his policing experience, leadership, and ability to command a force and engage at the highest levels with local, regional and national stakeholders. It was the unanimous view of the panel that he held the skills, abilities and qualities required to lead Dorset Police.

5.6 Mr Vaughan began his career in Wiltshire, in 1992, in various uniform and detective roles. On promotion he served as a Detective Sergeant and Detective Inspector up to 2005, when he joined the High Potential Development Scheme. As a Chief Inspector he undertook the role of staff officer to the Chief Constable and later led the centralisation of roads policing within the Operations Division.

Promoted to Detective Superintendent in 2007, Mr Vaughan led Wiltshire's response to major, serious and organised crime and delivered significant capability development, whilst leading and managing numerous murders and other major crime investigations. Upon promotion to Chief Superintendent, he led the development of Citizen Focused Policing, Partnerships and Safer Neighbourhoods across Wiltshire and was later the Head of Criminal Investigation.

In 2011, Mr Vaughan successfully completed the Strategic Command Course, and joined Dorset Police as Assistant Chief Constable in May 2012. Following promotion to Deputy Chief Constable in 2013, he led on strategic change, planning, performance, professional standards, people and community focus, and media and communication.

Mr Vaughan has also led various regional collaboration programmes including the forensic service collaboration and the strategic alliance with Devon and Cornwall Police. In his national capacity he is the NPCC Lead for Forensic Procurement and Market Development.

In February 2017, Mr Vaughan was appointed Deputy Chief Constable (Chief Operating Officer) for the Dorset, Devon and Cornwall Strategic Alliance. In April 2018, he was appointed Temporary Chief Constable for Dorset. He holds a Masters Degree in Criminology and Police Management. His service was recognised in the 2019 Honours when he was awarded the Queen's Police Medal.

6. TERMS AND CONDITIONS OF APPOINTMENT

6.1 The terms and conditions on which the candidate is to be appointed are given in the candidate information pack (Appendix A). To aid scrutiny, these terms and conditions have been revised, as follows, since last presented to the Police and Crime Panel:

- Salary updated to September 2018 figure, following police pay award;
- Provision of a 'cash alternative' should the postholder seek to provide his own car for private and business use, in line with updated Alliance policy;
- Chief Police Officers Staff Association (CPOSA) membership and insurance cost now met by OPCC;
- Inclusion of reasonableness clause in relocation expenses;
- Appointment for a fixed term (date updated).

7. RELEVANT INFORMATION

- 7.1 Members are reminded that a confirmation hearing was held in respect of Mr Vaughan's appointment as Temporary Chief Constable exactly one year ago.
- 7.2 Whilst there was no requirement for that previous confirmation hearing, an extraordinary and voluntary process was undertaken to allow the Police and Crime Panel the opportunity for scrutiny, and to provide transparency to the public.

8. LIST OF APPENDICES

- A. Candidate Information Pack (incorporating role profile, terms and conditions of appointment, and an overview of the selection process)
- B. Application Form (including monitoring information)
- C. Assessment Criteria
- D. Candidate Assessment (for applicants not yet at Chief Constable level).
- E. Independent Member report

SIMON BULLOCK CHIEF EXECUTIVE

Members' Enquiries to: Simon Bullock, Chief Executive (01202) 229084

Media Enquiries to: Sue Bloss, Head of Communications and Engagement (01202) 222405/229092